

REVIEW

BY ASS. PROF. DR. VESELINA KONDEVA -GLAVINKOVA , DD, PhD

Department of Pediatric Dental Medicine,
Faculty of Dental Medicine, Medical University Plovdiv

Chairman of the scientific jury for a competition for academic position

" ASSOCIATE PROFESSOR"

**in the specialty " *Social medicine and organization of health care and pharmacy* " ,
professional field 7.2. Dental Medicine
announced for the needs of the Medical University - Plovdiv, Department of Social
Medicine and Public Health in SG, issue. 56 / 16.07.2019**

The review has been compiled in accordance with the requirements of the ZRASRB and Section III / Section IV of the RAPRRSR - Terms and Conditions for Occupation of Academic Position "Assistant Professor" / "Professor"

The assessment review was made on the basis of the documents submitted by the applicants and the Act for development of the academic staff of the Republic of Bulgaria, its Rules and Regulations for application and the Rules of Medical University - Plovdiv.

The competition announced in the State Newspaper No.56 / 16.07.2019, Part two candidates , presented in alphabetical order :

- Chief assist. Dr. Mihailova Musurlieva, DD, PhD
- Chief assist. Dr. Yulia Bogdanova Peeva, DD, PhD

I. Applicant Career Profile Analysis.

Dr. Nina Mihailova Musurlieva

Dr. Nina Musurlieva was born on August 10, 1977 in Plovdiv. She has acquired a Master Degree in Dentistry from the Medical University of Plovdiv in 2001 with excellent success (5.78). In the period 2010 - 2012 she is a full-time doctoral student at the Department of Social Medicine and Public Health at the Medical University - Plovdiv. In 2013 she successfully defended her dissertation on "*Quality of life of patients with chronic periodontitis*" and acquire the educational and scientific degree "PhD" in the scientific specialty "Social Medicine and organization of Healthcare and Pharmacy."

The candidate's professional career began in 2003. - as a dental doctor at AIPP PD "Dr. Nina Musurlieva" and a specialist in Pediatric Dental Medicine. In 2007, she acquired a specialty in Pediatric Dentistry and in 2016 a second major in Social Medicine and Public Dental Health.

Her academic career began in 2012 as an assistant at the Department of Social Medicine and Public Health at the Medical University of Plovdiv and in 2014 she has been selected as a Senior and Administrative Assistant in the same department.

Dr. Musurlieva is a member of the Faculty Council of the Faculty of Public Health, Medical University - Plovdiv. She is also a member of several Bulgarian and international professional and scientific organizations, including: Bulgarian Dental Association (member of the Committee on Professional Ethics at the Regional College of Bulgarian Dental Association - Plovdiv and the National Committee on Professional Ethics of Bulgarian Dental Association); Union of Scientists in Bulgaria, Bulgarian Scientific Society for Public Health, Society for Pediatric Dental Medicine, Balkan Association of History and Philosophy of Medicine, European Association of Pediatric Dentistry.

She has extensive foreign languages knowledge - speaks Spanish, Russian and English.

Dr. Yulia Bogdanova Peeva

Dr. Yulia Peeva was born on 27.10. 1971 in Plovdiv. She has acquired a Master degree in "Dentistry" at the Medical University - Plovdiv in 1994 with success Very Good (4.72). In 2015 she successfully defended her dissertation on "*Awareness and motivation for orthodontic treatment of children from the city of Plovdiv*" and obtained her educational and scientific degree "Doctor" in the scientific specialty "Social medicine and organization of health care and pharmacy".

The candidate's professional career began in 1994 as a resident dentist. In 2003 she was working as a medical representative. Her academic career began in 2005 as an Assistant at the Department of Social Medicine and Health Management at the Medical University of Plovdiv. In 2009 she was selected as a Senior Assistant and in 2011 for an Assistant Professor in the Department of Social Medicine and Public Health. In 2008 Dr. Peeva has acquired a specialty in Social Medicine and Health Management. She has participated in a teaching exchange under the Erasmus program - in Bursa (Turkey), Genoa (Italy) and Bogota, (Colombia).

Dr. Peeva is a member of the Bulgarian Dentist Union, the Bulgarian Scientific Society of Public Health and the *Athens Institute for Education and Research*.

She has a wealth of foreign language skills – Dr. Peeva is fluent in English, French, Russian and Greek.

II. General description of the submitted materials for the competition.

The candidates have provided their documents and materials for the contest electronically, in compliance with the Act for development of the academic staff of the Republic of Bulgaria, its Rules and Regulations for application and the Rules of Medical University - Plovdiv.

III. Assessment of the applicant's academic work on overall academic development.

➤ *General characteristics of scientific production and publication activity*

Dr. Nina Musurlieva

The candidate participated in this competition with scientific production presented in the list of total 72 titles distributed as follows:

- Thesis "Quality of life in patients with chronic periodontitis" (2013);
- Individual monograph / Habilitation work "Challenges for the promotion of oral health in Bulgaria" (2019 years);
- Monographs - 2 pieces (one - self-developed and one in co-authorship);
- Books - 3 pieces (one - in English, two published in co-authorship);
- Publications in scientific journals refereed and indexed in world-known databases of scientific information - 8 (3 abstracts), including 5 in journals with IF;
- Publications and reports in non-refereed scientific journals, with scientific peer review or published in edited collective volumes - 34 number (listed in the scientific work of the candidate titles under numbers 56, 58, 59, 60, 68 and 72 are correctly represented as reports in non-refereed scientific journals, peer-reviewed, or published in edited collective volumes);
- Scientific reports - a total of 15 issues, of which :
 - ✓ Posts from foreign forums and summaries published in international journals and collections - 4;
 - ✓ Scientific reports on national and international forums in Bulgaria - 11 issues (3 of which with abstracts published).
- Textbooks - 2 pieces (a co-author and a separate English) both peer-reviewed and with internationally ISBN number.

The publications are in reputable journals, among which are refereed and indexed in the Web of Science and Scopus databases - *Health and Quality of Life Outcomes; Biotechnology and Biotechnological Equipment; Journal of Dental Research, Brazilian Dental Journal* et al.

Dr. Yulia Peeva

The candidate participated in this competition with scientific production presented a list of 72 titles, allocated as follows:

- Thesis "Awareness and motivation for orthodontic treatment of children from the city of Plovdiv" (2015);
- Independent monograph / rehabilitation work "Awareness and motivation for orthodontic treatment through the eyes of orthodontists, children and parents" (2017);
- An independent book, based on a dissertation thesis- 1 piece

- Publications in scientific journals, refereed and indexed in world-renowned scientific information databases - 11 in total (8 of them are abstracts). Nine of the publications are in IF journals and 6 of them are abstracts
- Publications and reports in non-refereed scientific journals, peer-reviewed or published in edited collective volumes - 55;
- Teaching aids – 3 pieces (two separate English without an international publishing number ISBN and one co-written in English by an international publishing number ISBN).

The publications are in renowned journals, among which are referenced and indexed in the Web of Science and Scopus databases - *Community Dental Health Journal*, *Osteoporosis International*, *Ann Reum Dis.*, *Evid-Based Complement Alternat Med*, *American Journal of Public Health* and others.

An essential part of the publications, especially those published in scientific journals, refereed and indexed in world-known databases of scientific information are summaries rather than full-text publications - 8 of the 11 publications. I believe that the abstract does not have the same weight and scientific value as a full-text publication. Some of the publications are also covered by magazines indirectly related to social medicine and public health, as well as to the professional direction of the competition 7.2. Dental Medicine.

➤ *Scientific activity - distribution and application of the scientific and practical achievements of applicants to the scientific community*

Dr. Nina Musurlieva

A general IF statement of 8,884 was submitted to the journals in which the applicant published, as well as an IF statement of 1,063 - from a publication cited in an IF journal.

Dr. Yulia Peeva

A reference is made to a general IF of 35,585 in the journals in which the candidate published, as well as a general IF of 47,752 of the journals in which articles were cited for her publications. These magazines are prestigious, but not accept the contribution of the candidate with such a burden (though candidate dentist), as she herself stated personally as well, as her contribution consists mainly in participation in the preparation of the study, statistical processing or translation. The publications which were published in journals with IF, were not directly related to specialty of the announced competition. They address specific and closely specialized medical problems such as the prevention and treatment of cardiovascular disease, lung disease, skin diseases, rheumatology. Dr. Peeva is the co-author of the third or n issues in the author team.

➤ *Participation in project implementation and management*

Dr. Nina Musurlieva

Information was provided for 4 participation in projects, one of them international:

- An international educational project for bilateral cooperation between MU - Plovdiv and the University of Tennessee;
- One project under the Operational Program “Human Resources Development” to support specialized publications in peer-reviewed publications with impact factor;

- An educational project of the Ministry of Education "Student Practices", where the candidate represents the training organization and participates as a mentor in the practical training of students.
- An inter-university scientific project "Comparative study of the accuracy of spatial objects created by different methods" .

Dr. Yulia Peeva

A list of 4 participations in projects and practical projects has been provided :

- Three of the projects are research and one of them is related to practical development (design of an intraoral apparatus).
- The fourth participation of the applicant is in a project for doctoral studies at the Medical University - Plovdiv.

➤ *Scientific and creative achievements (scientific authority)*

Dr. Nina Musurlieva

High personal contribution to research and publications has been proven - the candidate is a sole or first author in 63% of all works and in 33% of publications in scientific publications, referenced and indexed in world-renowned scientific information databases, which is an indicator of her leading role in the studies being conducted.

Dr. Musurlieva's scientific contributions can be summarized with a predominantly practical nature - both original and confirming existing scientific knowledge.

The main thematic areas in the candidate's research and scientific contributions are precisely identified in the following scientific areas: Oral health (risk factors for oral diseases; Quality of life; Promotion and prevention in dental medicine); Halitosis study; Dental practice training and communication; Dental Medicine; Health care.

I agree with the scientific contributions detailed in the applicant's reference. They are correctly defined, delimited by thematic areas and justified in the attached documents and scientific papers. A summarizing feature of her scientific works is that they are focused and actual topics, with original character, great potential for practical applicability and high personal contribution. Her proposed tool for assessing the quality of life of patients with chronic periodontitis is validated, tested and used in the research of foreign authors, which speaks to the scientific relevance of its development.

Dr. Musurlieva has been awarded for her participation in the Science and Youth Competition with First place in the section "Dental Medicine and Medicine ".

The candidate is an established expert in professional ethics - she is a member of the Committee on Professional Ethics at the Regional College of the Bulgarian Dentist Association - Plovdiv and a participant in the National Committee for Professional Ethics at Bulgarian Dentist Association. She took part in the preparation of a number of documents Regulations managing the work of the committees and in resolving ethical studies . Dr. Musurlieva is the author of a standard for the work of the committees on the professional ethics of the Bulgarian Dentist Association and the regional dental colleges in the country .

Dr. Musurlieva has been a reviewer of articles in two foreign journals - *Journal of Applied Oral Science* and *Medical Science Monitor* .

She is a member of the editorial board of three international journals - *Stomatology Edu Journal*; *Journal of Oral and Dental Health* and *Journal of Integrative Medicine*.

Dr. Yulia Peeva

The candidate is the sole or the first author in 53% of all works and in only one (9%) of the 11 publications in scientific publications, refereed and indexed in world-renowned databases .

The main thematic areas in the research activity and in the scientific contributions of the candidate are identified in the following scientific areas: Oral health ; Dental medicine ; Rheumatology and Public Health ; Cardiovascular disease prevention and public health ; Teaching methodology . Dr. Peeva's scientific contributions are predominantly practically applied - both original and validating existing scientific knowledge.

The broad scope of the subject matter , the original nature of the research and the great potential for practical applicability can be highlighted as a summarizing feature of the scientific works . Some of the topics in the publications are directed to specific fields of medicine and are not directly related to the field of the announced competition. Dr. Peeva's contribution to these publications, as she points out in the self-assessment of her own contributions, is a statistical analysis; participation in research planning and discussion of results and conclusions; translation into English.

Dr. Peeva was awarded the 1st prize in the section "Health Care" for her participation with a report in the competition "Science and Youth" 2010, Medical University - Plovdiv.

She is a peer reviewer of scientific papers in two refereed foreign journals - *EC Dental Science Journal* and *American Research Journals of Dentistry* .

Dr. Peeva is a member of the editorial board of three international journals, the *EC Dental Science Journal*, the *American Research Journals* and the *Journal of Oral Medicine* .

She has participated in a selection procedure with the European Commission (SANCO) for a public health expert.

IV. Evaluation of the monographic work or equivalent publications submitted for participation in the "ASSOCIATE PROFESSOR" competition by the applicant .

Dr. Nina Musurlieva has presented a single monograph / habilitation work "Challenges to the promotion of oral health in Bulgaria" (2019); presented in connection with the habilitation procedure, with a volume of 102 pages and a literary reference from 118 sources (21 in Cyrillic and 97 in Latin).

Two more monographs are presented in the candidate's scientific works:

- Musurlieva H . Administrative errors in dental practice. Lax Book 2018. *ISBN 978-619-189-102-3* . It addresses the administrative violations in dental practice and the sanctions that are imposed when admitted.

- Bozhkova T, Musurlieva H. Medico-social aspects of oral health in geriatric patients. Total toothlessness - quality of life. Lax Book 2019. ISBN 978-619-189-102-4). The monograph examines the particularities of the oral health of geriatric patients. The applicant provided a separation protocol for the authors' contributions. In self-assessment she correctly divided the points based on the number of authors. All three monographs have scientific reviewers.

Dr. Musurlieva participated in the competition with three books :

- one of which is self-published, in English, published abroad (Musurlieva N. Chronic periodontitis. Risk factors, quality of life. Lambert Academic Publishing 2015. ISBN 978-3-659-39763-9)

- two co-authored, published in Bulgaria and peer-reviewed (Musurlieva N, Boyadzhiev D, Stoykova M. Oral Hygiene and Chronic Periodontitis. Medical University - Plovdiv 2016. ISBN 978-619-7085-76-1) and (Musurlieva N, Stanev C. The Problem of errors in Dental practice - Can We Avoid Them and What is the Role of the Professional Organization in Solving It? Lax Book 2017. ISBN 978-619-189-080-4).

Dr. Yulia Peeva presented one self-published monograph / habilitation work "Awareness and motivation for orthodontic treatment through the eyes of orthodontists, children and parents" (2017) with a volume of 260 pages (of which 190 pages actually and 70 pages (appendices and sources) and literature references from 251 sources (38 in Cyrillic and 213 in Latin). The published monograph is directly related to her dissertation and completely repeats it in its content .

One book was presented (Peeva Y. Handbook of Hygienic Recommendations for Orthodontic Treatment. Plovdiv : "Lax book", 2019, ISBN: 978-619-189-128-3) on the basis of a protected dissertation. This guide is presented in the her dissertation and the monograph.

V. Reflection (citation) of the applicant's publications in national and foreign literature (publication image).

Dr. Nina Musurlieva

Evidences has been provided for the reflection of candidate's publications in national and foreign scientific literature. There are 14 publications of Dr. Musurlieva in a total of 39 scientific publications, 23 of which are from foreign authors.

10 of the citations are in scientific publications, refereed and indexed in world-renowned scientific information databases, 2 in monographs and collective volumes with scientific reviews and 27 in non-refereed journals with scientific reviews .

Dr. Yulia Peeva

According to the provided information, the total number of quotations of Dr. Peeva is 52. Quotations from foreign authors are 20. Fourteen of the total 16 cited publications of Dr. Peeva are quoted in four publications by a Bulgarian author and (from the last year) , including the same author in the team of authors . This fact shows that Dr. Peeva is not popular and reflects her achievements in the Bulgarian and international scientific literature.

VI. Comprehensive, qualitative assessment of teaching and teaching activities, incl. scientific guidance of students, doctoral students, postgraduate students.

Dr. Nina Musurlieva

Dr. Musurlieva has 7.5 years of teaching experience (preceded by a 3-year full-time doctorate). Its classroom and out-of-class employment is very high and exceeds the significantly adopted by the MU-Plovdiv employment rate for non-habilitated persons - an average of 987 hours for the last three years. She participates in the teaching of the subjects Social Medicine and Medical Ethics and Public Dental Health to students from the Master's programs in Medicine and Dental Medicine - Bulgarian and English. Dr. Musurlieva also participates in the English language course in these disciplines, in accordance with the number of allowed lectures for non-habilitated persons who have acquired the Doctor of Social Sciences. She is involved as well in the training of English language trainees and she is a supervisor of the Master's program in Public Health and Health management students' theses. In 2014 Dr Musurlieva has been selected as the administrative assistant of the Department. She works actively with students from BASDM and has collaborations with them. Dr Musurlieva is included in the individual English language teaching of foreign students participating in Erasmus student mobility.

The candidate is a sole author of a textbook in English on public dental health and co-author of a textbook focused on normative documents related to dental practice. Both textbooks are reviewed and international ISBN number.

Dr. Yulia Peeva

Dr. Peeva has 14.5 years of teaching experience and very high classroom employment, exceeding significantly the employment rate for non-rehabilitated persons from the MU - Plovdiv - on average 816 hours for the last 3 years. She participates in the teaching of the disciplines Medical statistics, Social medicine and medical ethics and Public dental health for students in the Master's programs in Medicine and Dental Medicine - Bulgarian and English language training. Dr. Peeva gives lectures on Social Medicine and Medical Ethic and Public Dental Health as well as she is teaching the internship and foreign students studying at MU, Plovdiv on Erasmus program

The candidate participates in the interns preparation for the State Examination in Social Medicine, as well as in the examination committees of candidate students for the specialty "Health Care" - bachelor and master. In the period 2011 – 2015 she is in charge of the teaching activities of the Department.

Dr. Peeva was a guest lecturer at several foreign universities in the framework of teaching exchange programs in Bursa (Turkey), Genoa (Italy) and Bogota (Colombia).

She is the author of two teaching aids - in English, aimed at respectively preparing and assessing the knowledge of foreign students in Bioethics and Social Medicine, but they are both without an international ISBN and are not peer-reviewed. Dr. Peeva is a second author in a peer-reviewed guide in English with an international ISBN, containing bioethics examinations.

Overall assessment of Dr. Nina Musurlieva of 2019. Reflecting the main directions of academic development, scientific, educational and teaching and administrative work was "very good" (81.8 appraisal.points).

Dr. Yulia Peeva 's overall assessment of 2019 , reflecting the main areas of academic development, scientific, educational and administrative activity is "very good" (76.2 points).

VIII. Critical notes and recommendations

My recommendation to Dr. Peeva is to publish in prestigious international journals with an impact factor her own research related to her specialty.

VIII. Overall assessment of the applicant's compliance with the mandatory conditions and the mandatory quantitative criteria and scientometric indicators in compliance with the Regulation for Occupation of Academic Positions in MU-Plovdiv in the "*Regulations for Occupation of Academic Position*" Assistant Professor "/" Professor "in MU-Plovdiv" and "*Evaluation Criteria*" (part of the Rules for the Structure and Activity of MU-Plovdiv).

Dr. Nina Musurlieva : It follows from the submitted and studied materials that the applicant fully covers the mandatory conditions and substantially exceeds the mandatory quantitative criteria and scientometric indicators according to the Regulation of the Medical University - Plovdiv.

Dr. Yulia Peeva : It follows from the submitted and studied materials that the applicant fully complies with the mandatory conditions and substantially exceeds the mandatory quantitative criteria and scientometric indicators according to the Regulation of the Medical University - Plovdiv.

Applicants' compliance with the mandatory scientometric indicators for borrowing of Associate Professor

Groups of indicators	Content	Number of required points	Dr Nina Musulieva (number of points)	Dr Yulia Peeva (number of points)
A	Indicator 1	50	50	50
Б	Indicator 2	-	-	-
В	Indicators 3 or 4	100	100	100
Г	Sum of Indicators from 5 to 9	200	1127	1173.21
Д	Sum of Indicators from 10 to 12	50	325	695
Е	Sum of Indicators from 13 till the end	-	225	130

Total			1827	2148
-------	--	--	------	------

***The Applicants' Compliance with the Mandatory Requirements and Scientometric Indicators
for holding the Academic position "Associate Professor" stated in the Rules of the MU –
Plovdiv***

Indicators	Minimum Quantitative Requirements	Dr Nina Musurlieva	Dr Yulia Peeva
Acquired Educational and Scientific Degree "Doctor"	1	1	1
Acquired specialty on the area of the announced competition	Yes	Yes	Yes
To hold position "Assistant", "Chief Assistant" and to have at least 5 years of experience in the specialty of the competition	да	7.5 years	14.5 years
Monograph	1	3 1 – habilitation work 1 – single author 1 – in coauthorship	1 (habilitation work)
Total number of publications	25	72	72
In refereed journals in world known data bases	7	8 (3 abstracts)	11 (8 abstracts)
In Impact factor journals	3	5 (1 abstract in 2 – first author in 2 – second author in 1 – third and following author)	9 (6 abstracts in all – third and following author)
Positive citations	20	39 (of which – 23 international)	52 (of which – 20 international)
Textbooks/Study materials	-	2 - 1 – in English; single author; with ISBN; - 1 – in coauthorship; with ISBN.	3 - 2 – in English; single author, without ISBN; - 1 – in English; in coauthorship; with ISBN.
Total		1827	2148

IX. Conclusion – “meet / does not meet” the mandatory and specific conditions and scientometric criteria - for the academic position "ASSOCIATE PROFESSOR"

Both candidates meet the mandatory and specific conditions and scientometric criteria set out in the the Act for Development of the Academic Staff in the Republic of Bulgaria and the Rules and regulations of MU – Plovdiv for the academic position “Associate Professor”.

X. Proposal for the ranking / occupation of the post

Analyzing in detail the scientific production of the two candidates, I evaluate Dr. Nina Musurlieva's application as stronger in the announced competition . Despite the smaller total number of points on the quantitative criteria, Dr. Musurlieva has significant qualitative advantages and I will argue for this:


1. Dr. Musurlieva has a shorter professional experience and teaching experience, but has a significantly higher audience and extracurricular employment as well and has a higher publishing productivity per years academic experience.
2. Much of Dr. Musurlieva's scientific output, including her publications in Impact Magazine, contains results from her own research. A number of publications in which Dr. Peeva has participated, including her publications bearing the IF, are in specific fields of medicine and are not directly related to the field of the announced competition, where she is the third and subsequent co-author with other scientists - evidence of fewer own studies.
3. Dr. Musurlieva is a sole or first author in 63% of publications, and Dr. Peeva in 53%.
4. The quotations of Dr. Nina Musurlieva show the popularity and reflection of her scientific output in the Bulgarian and international scientific literature. Her scientific work is the basis for other scientists' research and is being put into practice. Despite the larger total number of citations by Dr. Yulia Peeva - all citations by foreign authors are in a single publication, in which she is the third author, and which is not directly related to the field of the announced competition.
5. Dr. Musurlieva participates in the competition with three monographs, two of which she is a separate author. All three monographs do not repeat her dissertation. Dr. Peeva has participated in a monograph that completely repeats her dissertation.
6. Dr. Musurlieva works actively with the students of BASDM at the Faculty of Social Sciences in Plovdiv and they have common scientific developments.
7. Dr. Musurlieva has a higher overall appraisal score than in 2019 of 81.8 points and Dr. Peeva of 76.2 points.
8. According to the “List of Documents Required for Academic Assistant Professor” of MU-Plovdiv, for the needs of English language training, applicants must submit an up-to-date certificate of English language, diplomas from English

high schools are recognized, TOEFEL, Cambridge certificate . Dr. Peeva has not presented the documents listed.

All this gives me the grounds to propose the following ranking of candidates in this competition for the academic position of Assistant Professor in the scientific specialty Social Medicine and Organization of Health and Pharmacy:

- 1. Chief Assist. Dr. Nina Mihailova Musurlieva, DD**
- 2. Chief Assist. Dr. Yulia Bogdanova Peeva, DD**

21 .11.2019
Plovdiv

Prepared the review: 
Assoc. Prof. Veselina Kandeveva, MD