

STATEMENT OF OPINION

from

**Associate Professor Dimitar Nikiforov Kirov, Ph.D**

**Department of Prosthetic Dentistry, Faculty of Dental Medicine, Sofia University,**

**External member of the Scientific Jury - Order No. R-2314/07/05/2024.**

**Regarding:** Competition for the occupation of the Academic position "Associate professor" in the field of higher education 7. Health care and sports by professional direction 7.2. Dental medicine. Scientific specialty Prosthetic Dentistry, for the needs of teaching in Bulgarian and English in the Department of Prosthetic Dentistry, FDM, Medical University - Plovdiv, published in the Official Gazette. no. 35/19.04.2024 and on the website of MU - Plovdiv.

There are four candidates who have submitted documents for participation in the competition, arranged in alphabetical order of their surnames:

1. Dr. Tanya Pavlova Bozhkova, Ph.D.
2. Dr. Rada Torezova Kazakova, Ph.D.
3. Dr. Zlatina Tomova Tomova-Veleva, Ph.D.
4. Dr. Dobromira Antonova Shopova-Karatsanova, Ph.D.

## **I. ANALYSIS OF THE CANDIDATES' CAREER PROFILE.**

### **1. Tania Pavlova Bozhkova, Ph.D., ch. assistant**

Dr. Tanya Pavlova Bozhkova was born on 13.11.1987 in the town of Sliven. In 2012, he graduated from the Faculty of Dental Medicine, Plovdiv. From 2013 to 2017, he was a full-time doctoral student at the Department of Prosthetic Dentistry of the Faculty of Medicine, MU-Plovdiv. Since 2017, he has held the position of assistant in the Department of Prosthetic Dental Medicine, FDM, MU - Plovdiv. In 2017, he obtained the educational and scientific degree "Doctor" after completing a dissertation on the topic: "Comparative analysis of different methods for registering occluso-articulation relationships". In 2014, he acquired the specialty "Prosthetic Dentistry". In 2020, he held the academic position "Ch. assistant". Dr. Tanya Bozhkova is a member of BZS, BZS and BNDDM.

Level of English language proficiency - B2.

### **2. Dr. Rada Torezova Kazakova, Ph.D. , ch. assistant**

Dr. Rada Torezova Kazakova was born on 02.06.1983 in Stara Zagora. In 2008, he graduated from the Faculty of Dental Medicine, Plovdiv. Since 2010, she has been enrolled as a specialist at the Department of Prosthetic Dentistry of the Faculty of Medicine, MU-Plovdiv. Since 2012, he has held the position of assistant in the Department of Prosthetic Dental Medicine, FDM, MU - Plovdiv. In 2014, he acquired the specialty "Prosthetic Dentistry". In 2017, he obtained the educational and scientific degree "Doctor" after completing a dissertation on the topic: "Methods for the preparation of gingival tissues in permanent prosthetics". In the same year, he acquired the specialty "Prosthetic Dentistry". In 2020, he held the academic position "Ch. assistant". From 2021, she is assigned to work at the Scientific Research Institute of MU-Plovdiv, Department of Modern Technologies in Dental Medicine. Dr. Rada Torezova Kazakova has work experience in the specialty as an assistant for 7 years. 8 m. and 29 days and as Chief Assistant 4 years. 2 m. and 4 days in MU-Plovdiv. He is a member of BZS, Union of Scientists, Bulgarian Orthodontic Society, Dental Laser Society, Bulgarian Academy of Aesthetic Dentistry, BZS and BNDDM.

Level of English language proficiency C1.

### **3. Dr. Zlatina Tomova Tomova-Veleva, Ph.D. , ch. assistant**

Dr. Zlatina Tomova Tomova-Veleva was born on March 1, 1980 in the city of Plovdiv. In 2005, he graduated from the Faculty of Dental Medicine, Plovdiv. Since 2007, she has been enrolled as a specialist at the Department of Prosthetic Dentistry of the Faculty of Medicine, MU-Plovdiv. Since 2017, he has held the position of assistant in the Department of Prosthetic Dental Medicine, FDM, MU - Plovdiv. In 2020, he obtained the educational and scientific degree "Doctor" after completing a dissertation on the topic: "Laboratory study of the corrosion resistance and tensile strength of non-noble alloys for metal-ceramics". in 2021 he acquired the specialty "Prosthetic Dentistry". In 2021 holds the academic position "Ch. assistant". Dr. Zlatina Tomova Tomova-Veleva has work experience in the specialty as an assistant for 4 years. 10 m. and 17 days and as Chief Assistant 2 years. 4 m. and 25 days in MU-Plovdiv. Member of the Bulgarian Dental Union, Member of the Bulgarian Scientific Society.

Level of English language proficiency - C1.

### **4. Dr. Dobromira Antonova Shopova-Karatsanova, Ph.D. , ch. assistant**

Dr. Dobromira Antonova Shopova - Karatsanova was born on 09.12.1980 in the city of Plovdiv. In 2006, he graduated from the Faculty of Dental Medicine, Plovdiv. Since 2007, she has been enrolled as a specialist at the Department of Prosthetic Dentistry of the Faculty of Medicine, MU-Plovdiv. Since 2007, he has held the position of assistant in the Department of Prosthetic Dental Medicine, FDM, MU - Plovdiv. In 2012, he acquired the specialty "Prosthetic Dentistry". In 2019, he obtained the educational and scientific degree "Doctor" after completing a dissertation on the topic: "Comparative analysis of impression materials for functional shaping of the individual spoon of a completely edentulous upper jaw". In 2020, he held the academic position "Ch. assistant". Dr. Dobromira Shopova-Karatsanova has work experience in the specialty as an assistant for 12 years. 6 m. and 17 days and as Chief Assistant 4 years. 2 m. and 12 days in MU-Plovdiv. Member of the Bulgarian Dental Union, Member of the Bulgarian Academy of Aesthetic Dentistry, Member of the Bulgarian Scientific Society, Member of the Union of Scientists in Bulgaria, Member of the Bulgarian Scientific Society of Public Health.

Level of English language proficiency - B2.

## **II. GENERAL DESCRIPTION OF THE SUBMITTED MATERIALS FOR THE COMPETITION**

### **1. Tania Pavlova Bozhkova, Ph.D., Ph.D. ch. assistant**

The documents submitted by the candidate in the competition correspond to the requirements of the ŽRASRB, PPZRASRB and the Rules for the terms and conditions for acquiring scientific degrees and holding academic positions at MU-Plovdiv (PURPNSZAD).

### **2. Dr. Rada Torezova Kazakova, Ph.D., ch. assistant**

The documents submitted by the candidate in the competition correspond to the requirements of the ŽRASRB, PPZRASRB and the Regulations for the terms and conditions for acquiring scientific degrees and holding academic positions at MU-Plovdiv (PURPNSZAD).

### **3. Dr. Zlatina Tomova Tomova-Veleva, Ph.D, ch. Assistant**

The documents submitted by the candidate in the competition correspond to the requirements of the ŽRASRB, PPZRASRB and the Regulations for the terms and conditions for acquiring scientific degrees and holding academic positions at MU-Plovdiv (PURPNSZAD).

There are no attached documents for membership in Scientific organizations. There is no attached Reference for the impact factor and evidentiary material from the information database (Article 29, Item 13 of the Regulations of MU-Plovdiv).

#### **4. Dr. Dobromira Antonova Shopova-Karatsanova, Ph.D, ch. Assistant**

The documents submitted by the candidate in the competition correspond to the requirements of the ŽRASRB, PPZRASRB and the Regulations for the terms and conditions for acquiring scientific degrees and holding academic positions at MU-Plovdiv (PURPNSZAD).

All tender documents are precisely prepared and presented in a convenient format for working with them. The author reference of the original scientific contributions reflects the scientific and scientific-applied contributions in the publications presented in this competition.

### **III. EVALUATION OF THE SCIENTIFIC WORKS OF THE CANDIDATES FOR THE OVERALL ACADEMIC DEVELOPMENT**

#### **1. Dr. Tanya Pavlova Bozhkova, Ph.D**

##### **1.1. Scientific publications:**

Dr. Tanya Pavlova Bozhkova, PhD, participated in the competition with 76 scientific publications. 3 items are excluded from the total number of publications. publications for the awarding of the ONS "Doctor".

**I accept 73 scientific articles** for participation in the competition, of which:

- 2 scientific publications with IF on THOMSON-REUTERS.
- 14 scientific publications referenced and indexed in world-famous databases with scientific information. I do not accept post 15 as referenced.
- 27 scientific publications in other non-refereed, peer-reviewed publications.
- 30 publications in non-refereed journals in Bulgarian and English.

From the total number of publications, it is not indicated which of them are excluded for occupying the academic position of "Chief Assistant".

##### **1.2. Scientific projects:**

Dr. Tanya Bozhkova presents participation in 9 intra-university and general education projects at MU-Plovdiv.

#### **2. Dr. Rada Torezova Kazakova, Ph.D**

##### **2.1. Scientific publications:**

Dr. Rada Torezova Kazakova, PhD, according to self-assessment, submits 228 scientific papers for participation in the competition.

**I do not accept** as scientific publications 7 of them (#8.5, 8.14, 8.15, 8.16, 8.17, 8.18, 8.19), which were published in SYLWAN. English Edition.

I do not accept as scientific publications those presented from #8.78 to 8.104. Oral Academy Bulgaria is a platform for communication between colleagues and a social network, not a scientific publication.

**I also do not accept** posts from #8.25 to 8.34 posted on Zenodo online file sharing platform. All of them average between 1.5 – 2 pages, together with the bibliography and title page, which I cannot accept as a serious scientific publication.

**I do not accept** the presented participations in congresses, seminars, practical courses, demonstrations, simulant translations, etc. presented as publications. from #8.105 to 8.207, excluding #8.175 (scientific publication in Folia Medica).

From the total number of publications, it is not indicated which of them are excluded for occupying the academic position of "Chief Assistant".

**I recognize 82 scientific** works for participation in the competition, of which:

- 12 Scientific publications with IF on THOMSON-REUTERS.
- 9 scientific publications referenced and indexed in world-famous databases with scientific information.
- 16 scientific publications in non-refereed, peer-reviewed publications.
- 45 publications in non-refereed journals in Bulgarian and English.

### **2.2. Scientific projects:**

Dr. Rada Kazakova participates as a member of the research team in 2 intra-university projects at the MU-Plovdiv and is an Academic Mentor in 2.

## **3. Dr. Zlatina Tomova Tomova-Veleva, Ph.D**

### **3.1. Scientific publications:**

Dr. Zlatina Tomova Tomova-Veleva, PhD, submitted 22 scientific papers for participation in the competition.

- 6 scientific publications with IF on THOMSON-REUTERS.
- 8 scientific publications referenced and indexed in world-renowned databases with scientific information. I do not accept post #15 as referenced.
- 8 scientific publications in other non-refereed or peer-reviewed publications.

From the total number of publications, it is not indicated which of them are excluded for occupying the academic position of "Chief Assistant".

### **3.2. Scientific projects:**

Dr. Zlatina Tomova Tomova-Veleva, presents participation in 3 intra-university scientific projects, at MU-Plovdiv. Attached is a memo for participation in 1 international scientific educational project with European funding, which is in the process of implementation.

## **4. Dr. Dobromira Antonova Shopova-Karatsanova, Ph.D**

### **4.1. Scientific publications:**

Dr. Dobromira Antonova Shopova-Karatsanova, PhD, submitted 93 scientific papers for participation in the competition.

**I do not accept** publication #12 as refereed because it is not present in the Scopus or WoS databases, but I accept it as non-refereed with peer review.

From the total number of publications, it is not indicated which of them are excluded for occupying the academic position of "Chief Assistant".

**I recognize 93 scientific articles** for participation in the contest, of which:

- 11 Scientific publications with IF by THOMSON-REUTERS.
- 18 scientific publications referenced and indexed in world-renowned databases with scientific information.
- 33 scientific publications in other non-refereed, peer-reviewed publications.
- 31 publications in non-refereed journals in Bulgarian and English.

### **4.2. Scientific projects:**

Dr. Dobromira Antonova Shopova-Karatsanova presents participation in 10 scientific projects at MU-Plovdiv. In two of them he is the lead researcher, in one the project manager and in the others he is a member of the research team.

## **IV. EVALUATION OF THE MONOGRAPHIC WORK OR EQUIVALENT PUBLICATIONS SUBMITTED FOR PARTICIPATION IN THE COMPETITION**

### **Monographs, habilitation work and teaching aids:**

#### **1. Dr. Tanya Pavlova Bozhkova, Ph.D**

Dr. Tanya Bozhkova participated with a monographic work under indicator B (Habilitation work - monograph - 100 points) "Bozhkova T. Digital study of occlusion. 2021. Second Supplementary Edition. Macros Publishing House. ISBN 978-954-561-542-9".

The candidate participates in the competition with 2 published monographs, which are not presented as the main habilitation thesis (Indicator G item 5 - 200 pts) and one book based on a defended dissertation (Indicator G item 6 - 40 pts).

### **2. Dr. Rada Torezova Kazakova, Ph.D**

Dr. Rada Kazakova participated with a monographic work under indicator B (Habilitation work - monograph - 100 points) Kazakova, R. Contemporary Approaches to Gingival Retraction in Fixed Prosthodontics. Laser Troughing Utility. 'Bulgari' Publishing House, Sofia, 2024. ISBN: 978-619-7656-46-6.

The candidate participates in the competition with 2 published monographs, which are not presented as the main habilitation thesis (Indicator G, item 5 - 200 pts):

Dr. Rada Kazakova also participated with a published university textbook (Indicator E item 21 - 6.67 pts).

### **3. Dr. Zlatina Tomova Tomova-Veleva, Ph.D**

The candidate participates in a monographic work according to indicator C (Habilitation work - monograph or scientific publications - 100 pts) "3D PRINTING IN PROSTHETIC DENTAL MEDICINE" Dr. Zlatina Tomova Tomova, Publisher: Medical University - Plovdiv, ISBN 978-619-237- 126-5.

Dr. Zlatina Tomova Tomova-Veleva presents a published monograph, which was not presented as the main habilitation work (Indicator G pt. 5 - 100 pts):

Dr. Tomova presents 1 published university textbook (Indicator E item 21 - 2.5 pts).

### **4. Dr. Dobromira Antonova Shopova-Karatsanova, Ph.D**

The candidate participates with a monographic work according to indicator B (Habilitation work - monograph or scientific publications - 100 pts) "Shopova D. "Upper edentulous jaw - anatomy, impressions and modern non-implantological prosthetic constructions" - University Publishing House "Kliment Ohridski" - Sofia, 2021 d. ISBN 978-954-07-5297-6".

Dr. Dobromira Shopova-Karatsanova presents two published monographs that are not presented as the main habilitation work (Indicator G, item 5 - 200 pts):

Published 2 books (which have an ISBN) based on a protected dissertation work for the award of the educational and scientific degree "Doctor". (Indicator G item 6 - 80 pts)

Dr. Dobromira Shopova-Karatsanova presents 6 published university textbooks (Indicator E items 21 - 26.3 items).

Participation in 2 published university textbook or textbook that is used in the school network (Indicator E item 20 - item 16).

## **V. REFLECTION (CITATION) OF THE CANDIDATE'S PUBLICATIONS IN NATIONAL AND FOREIGN LITERATURE**

### **1. Dr. Tanya Pavlova Bozhkova, Ph.D**

Dr. Tanya Bozhkova presents a report from BNDI to FDM-Plovdiv for citations of her publications. The total number of cited citations is 229, of which 88 are in international refereed editions, 90 in non-refereed Bulgarian and foreign editions, and 13 in dissertations, monographs and collective volumes. I do not accept 8 of them which are self-citations. There are 48 reviews for scientific publications.

### **2. Dr. Rada Torezova Kazakova, Ph.D**

Dr. Rada Kazakova presents a self-prepared reference for citations of her publications. In total, the cited citations are 190, of which 88 are in international refereed publications, 60 in non-refereed Bulgarian and foreign publications, 42 in monographs, collective volumes and 52 reviews for refereed scientific publications. I do not accept 2 citations that are self-citations.

### **3. Dr. Zlatina Tomova Tomova-Veleva, Ph.D**

Dr. Zlatina Tomova Tomova-Veleva presents a reference for citations of her publications. In total, there are 21 citations, of which 17 are in international refereed publications, 4 in non-refereed Bulgarian and foreign publications. There are 11 reviews for refereed scientific publications.

### **4. Dr. Dobromira Antonova Shopova-Karatsanova, Ph.D**

Dr. Dobromira Shopova-Karatsanova presents a reference for citations of her publications. The total number of cited citations is 114, of which 53 are in international refereed editions, 47 in non-refereed Bulgarian and foreign editions, and 14 in monographs and collective volumes. There are also 53 reviews for refereed scientific publications and 2 for non-refereed ones.

## **VI. COMPREHENSIVE, QUALITATIVE EVALUATION OF THE TEACHING-METHODOLOGICAL AND TEACHING ACTIVITY, INCL. SCIENTIFIC GUIDANCE OF STUDENTS, DOCTORAL STUDENTS, SPECIALISTS**

### **Teaching and learning activities:**

#### **1. Dr. Tanya Pavlova Bozhkova, Ph.D**

Dr. Tanya Bozhkova provides a certificate of teaching activity and academic workload for the academic years 2021/2022 and 2022/2023. The applicant is a teacher holding the position of Principal Assistant since 2020. From the reference provided, it is clear that the total workload for the last two years is as follows:

1. Academic year 2021/2022 – 621.8 hours
2. Academic year 2022/2023 – 613.2 hours

Total number of points from study load (auditory + non-auditory) for the last 2 years at 0.5 t/hour - 617.5 points

The total number of points under Indicator "G", respectively, is the sum of study load 617.5 points + 400 points for the occupied academic position "chief assistant" in the last two years = 1017.5 points.

#### **2. Dr. Rada Torezova Kazakova, Ph.D**

Dr. Rada Kazakova provides a certificate of teaching activity and academic workload for the academic years 2022/2023 and 2023/2024. The applicant is a teacher holding the academic position of principal assistant since 2020. According to the reference submitted by the applicant, the total workload for the last two years is:

1. Academic year 2021/2022 – 218 hours
2. Academic year 2022/2023 – 345 hours

Total number of points from study load (auditory + non-auditory) for the last 2 years at 0.5 t/hour - 0 points. I do not accept the 410.5 points presented by the candidate (arithmetically, they are 281.5) for academic performance.

The total number of points under Indicator "G", respectively, is the sum of the study load 0 points + 418 points for the occupied academic position "chief assistant" in the last two years = 418 points.

### **3. Dr. Zlatina Tomova Tomova-Veleva, Ph.D**

Dr. Zlatina Tomova-Veleva provides a certificate of teaching activity and academic workload for the academic years 2021/2022 and 2022/2023. The candidate is a teacher, holding the position of chief assistant since 2021. The candidate is participating in postgraduate training in the Department of Prosthetic Dentistry.

From the reference provided, it is clear that the study load for the last two years is as follows:

1. Academic year 2021/2022 – 1025.2 hours
2. Academic year 2022/2023 – 1015 hours

Total number of points from study load (auditory + non-auditory) for the last 2 years at 0.5 t/hour - 1020.1 points

The total number of points according to Indicator "G", respectively, is the sum of study load 1020.1 points + 200 points for the occupied academic position "chief assistant" in the last two years = 1220.1 points.

### **4. Dr. Dobromira Antonova Shopova-Karatsanova, Ph.D**

Dr. Dobromira Shopova-Karatsanova provides a certificate of teaching activity and academic workload for the academic years 2021/2022 and 2022/2023. The candidate is a teacher, holding the position of chief assistant since 2021. The candidate is participating in postgraduate training in the Department of Prosthetic Dentistry.

From the reference provided, it is clear that the study load for the last two years is as follows:

1. Academic year 2021/2022 – 1161.2 hours
2. Academic year 2022/2023 – 993 hours

Total number of points from study load (auditory + non-auditory) for the last 2 years at 0.5 t/hour - 1077.1 points

The total number of points under Indicator "G", respectively, is the sum of study load 1077.1 points + 416.7 points for the occupied academic position "chief assistant" in the last two years = 1493.8 points.

## **VII. CRITICAL NOTES AND RECOMMENDATIONS**

### **1. Dr. Tanya Pavlova Bozhkova, Ph.D**

Critical notes: The documents are not arranged according to the relevant paragraphs in chronological order, which further creates difficulties in their examination and analysis.

### **2. Dr. Rada Torezova Kazakova, Ph.D**

Critical notes: In the indicators under item D, participations in congresses, seminars, practical courses, simulant translations and platforms for communication between colleagues and social networks are incorrectly presented as publications.

Recommendations: I recommend the candidate to focus his efforts on publishing the results of his research activity in authoritative scientific publications.

### **3. Dr. Zlatina Tomova Tomova-Veleva, Ph.D**

Although the candidate meets the mandatory minimum of scientometric indicators, I recommend Dr. Zlatina Tomova Tomova-Veleva to publish more results of her research work in prestigious refereed publications.

#### **4. Dr. Dobromira Antonova Shopova-Karatsanova, Ph.D**

I have no significant critical comments on the content of the competition materials and in particular on the scientific works of Dr. Dobromira Shopova-Karatsanova. I found minor inaccuracies in some of the submitted descriptions of the applicant's activities, which do not spoil the overall very good impression of the evaluated application.

### **VIII. GENERAL ASSESSMENT OF THE APPLICANT'S COMPLIANCE WITH THE MANDATORY CONDITIONS AND MANDATORY QUANTITATIVE CRITERIA AND SCIENTOMETRIC INDICATORS ACC. REGULATION FOR OCCUPYING ACADEMIC POSITIONS AT MU-PLOVDIV.**

After a thorough review and analysis of the documents and evidence provided to me by the four candidates in the competition for the academic position "associate professor" for the needs of the Department of Prosthetic Dentistry of the Faculty of Dental Medicine, MU-Plovdiv, I believe that **one of the candidates does not have a teaching workload in the last 3 years** - doctor and Dr. Rada Torezova Kazakova, Ph.D.

#### **Reasons:**

Pursuant to the Ordinance on the academic and scientific teaching employment of professors at MU-Plovdiv (Decision of the AC - Minutes No. 4/01.04.2021), art. 2: "The educational work of habilitated and non-habilitated teachers covers classroom and extra-auditory activities with students, doctoral students and specialists.

#### **Classroom occupancy:**

"Art. 9. (1) Academic work includes: lectures with students, doctoral students and specialists (including SID); exercises, seminars and practical activities with students and trainees; (clinical practice with students from the specialties "Nurse", "Midwife", "Medical Assistant" and the specialties at the Medical College;) exams according to the curriculum (semester, state) competitive exams for AD, doctoral students, specialty".

#### **Non-auditory employment:**

"Art. 11. Extra-auditory work includes: preparation of study materials incl. electronic resources, supervision of doctoral students, supervision of specialists, supervision or review of diploma theses, consultations with students and individual scientific work with students, supervision of student scientific circles, course supervisors, supervisors of majors (for MK), chief administrative assistants, responsible on educational, scientific and international activity, quality, e-learning, SDO, for the departmental information on the site".

Dr. Rada Torezova Kazakova, doctor, has submitted for participation in the current competition a service note for teaching workload with **zero hours of classroom and extra-auditory activity for the last three years**. The note for teaching employment submitted by the applicant contains only research activity (reviews, participation in scientific forums, which are counted under another indicator), which, in my personal opinion, does not reflect the essence of the applicant's educational workload requirement (at least during leave).

### **IX. CONCLUSION**

After a thorough review and analysis of the documents and evidence provided to me by the four candidates in the competition for the Academic position "Docent" in the field of higher education 7. Health care and sports by professional direction 7.2. Dental medicine, scientific specialty Prosthetic dentistry, for the needs of teaching Bulgarian and English in the Department of Prosthetic Dentistry, FDM, Medical University - Plovdiv, that **two of the candidates fully meet the mandatory conditions and are distinguished by higher**



**scientometric indicators - Dr. Dobromira Antonova Shopova-Karatsanova, PhD (5246.3 points) and Dr. Tanya Pavlova Bozhkova, PhD (5169.2 points).**

Although the scientometric indicators of Dr. Rada Torezova Kazakova exceed the required minimum, I consider that she is inferior in terms of the mandatory conditions and scientometric indicators of the above two candidates (4615.72 points).

Dr. Zlatina Tomova Tomova-Veleva meets the mandatory conditions, but has lower scientometric indicators than the other candidates (2278,83 points). I think she has considerable potential, but she needs to gain more teaching and research experience before taking up the academic position of "associate professor".

The quality of the scientific developments of all candidates in the current competition is a testimony to their serious research activity. I would like to congratulate all four candidates for their worthy performance in the competition and wish them success in their professional development.

## **X. PROPOSAL FOR RANKING/OCCUPATION**

Based on the materials provided to me and a comparative analysis of the mandatory conditions and mandatory quantitative criteria, and scientific indicators, I rank the candidates as follows:

- 1. Dr. Dobromira Antonova Shopova-Karatsanova, Ph.D.**
- 2. Dr. Tanya Pavlova Bozhkova, Ph.D.**
3. Dr. Zlatina Tomova Tomova-Veleva, Ph.D.
4. Dr. Rada Torezova Kazakova, Ph.D.

After familiarizing myself with the materials and scientific works presented in the competition, analyzing their significance and the scientific, scientific-applied and applied contributions contained in them, I find it reasonable to give my positive assessment and vote with a **POSITIVE VOTE** for awarding the academic position "Associate Professor " by **Dr. Dobromira Antonova Shopova-Karatsanova, Ph.D. and Dr. Tanya Pavlova Bozhkova, Ph.D.**

Sofia

15.08.2024

Member of the Scientific Jury:

Assoc. Dr. Dimitar Kirov, Ph.D.